Pages 69-108 14<sup>th</sup> February 2018

APPLICATION NO: 17/02447/FUL		OFFICER: Mr Ben Hawkes	
DATE REGISTERED: 16th December 2017		DATE OF EXPIRY: 10th February 2018	
WARD: Prestbury		PARISH: Prestbury	
APPLICANT:	Mr & Mrs Minihane		
AGENT:	Mr Mark Le Grand		
LOCATION:	St Francis, Park Lane, Prestbury		
PROPOSAL:	Demolish existing and construct a new detached dwelling		

# **Update to Officer Report**

## 1. OFFICER COMMENTS

1.1. Since the publication of the officer report, a local resident has made an application to Historic England for the building to be listed. Historic England has rejected this application and the report detailing the reasons for their decision is attached.

Application Name: St Francis, Park Lane

Number: 1454411
Type: New
Heritage Category: Listing

Address:

St. Francis, Park Lane, Prestbury, Cheltenham, GL52 3BN

County	District	District Type	Parish
Gloucestershire	Cheltenham	District Authority	Prestbury

Recommendation: Reject

#### **Assessment**

#### **CONTEXT & BACKGROUND**

We have received an application requesting that we consider St Francis, Prestbury, Gloucestershire, for listing. The site is the subject of a current planning application for the demolition of the house and replacement with a new dwelling. This application is due to go before Planning Committee for determination on 15 February 2018, and there is therefore a high degree of urgency in achieving an outcome in the listing assessment.

The house is not within a conservation area although the LPA is currently consulting on designating Park Lane Conservation Area, which would include the building.

#### **HISTORY & DETAILS**

The house known as St Francis was built in 1926 along with the neighbouring detached residence known as Kennan, although only their building plots are marked on the Ordnance Survey Map of 1932. The pair of buildings were designed by Welsh architect Walter Prosser of Newport on plots towards the end of Park Lane, which had mainly been developed in 1908-1911, overlooking Cheltenham Racecourse. St Francis has what appears to be a rear addition in similar materials and style (shown on 1955 mapping), but of lower ridge height, to which a further small addition was built and subsequently removed. Other features such as window units have been replaced. Built in the Arts and Crafts style, St Francis is of pseudo-butterfly plan and built of coursed rubble limestone with half-timbering to the upper floor of the central entrance bay. The half-hipped roofs have kneelered oversailing eaves and are covered in clay tiles, and there are brick stacks. Interior fittings such as fireplaces appear to be of a standard design.

#### DISCUSSION

The Principles of Selection for Listing Buildings (March 2010) state that buildings of pre-1700 date that

contain a significant proportion of their original fabric are listed. Also, that most buildings of pre-1840 date are listed. After 1840, because of the greatly increased number of buildings erected and the much larger numbers that have survived, progressively greater selection is necessary. Our Listing Selection Guide Domestic 4: The Modern House and Housing (December 2017) gives further guidance. For Arts and Crafts houses, interest lies in their subtle qualities of composition and detailing, requiring sensitive evaluation. Simplicity is a virtue: beauty was implied in the perfection of proportion. Care was taken with local materials, sparing ornament, neatly detailed door cases, picture-rails and cornices, together with fireplaces, and a good staircase, and some limited use of panelling and built-in fittings. Other common ingredients can be seen in the planning of the house. Long plans are distinctive, with an entrance hall that serves also as a room for entertaining, a large fireplace and perhaps an inglenook; the other principal rooms are set to either side off corridors, with a service wing providing well-lit and comfortable working accommodation. It is also important to look carefully at the setting of these houses - the integration of house and garden is an important feature of the time.

With reference to the Principles of Selection and our Selection Guide Domestic 4: The Modern House and Housing, St Francis, a detached house of 1926, is not recommended for listing for the following principal reasons:

#### Architectural interest:

- the house, although neatly designed, lacks the characteristic careful massing and vernacular-inspired detailing of better Arts and Crafts buildings of this period:
- the use of two architectural styles, a version of a butterfly plan and 'Mock Tudor' styling, noted by the applicant, does not add to its claims to special interest;
- the architect, while a competent designer and planner of numerous buildings in the early C20, is not of particular note and none of his buildings are currently listed in England;
- the modest fittings, though pleasant, do not demonstrate the craftsmanship and inventiveness which is typically found in the more interesting Arts and Crafts houses, and the design lacks features such as inglenooks, high-quality timberwork or built-in furniture, which would set it apart from its many peers:
- original features such as window frames have been removed and the building appears to have been extended to the rear.

#### Historic interest:

St Francis has no known claims.

## Group value:

its position as a pair of houses of similar design does not significantly add to its interest on a national level, especially as the buildings now have variations between their footprints.

### CONCLUSION

St Francis falls short of the level of architectural interest which would be necessary for a house of this early C20 date to merit listing in the national context.